



Legislative Assembly of Alberta

The 29th Legislature  
Third Session

Select Special  
Auditor General Search  
Committee

Tuesday, July 18, 2017  
9:30 a.m.

Transcript No. 29-3-1

**Legislative Assembly of Alberta  
The 29th Legislature  
Third Session**

**Select Special Auditor General Search Committee**

Shepherd, David, Edmonton-Centre (ND), Chair  
Malkinson, Brian, Calgary-Currie (ND), Deputy Chair

Cyr, Scott J., Bonnyville-Cold Lake (W)  
Gill, Prab, Calgary-Greenway (PC)  
Horne, Trevor A.R., Spruce Grove-St. Albert (ND)  
Kleinsteuber, Jamie, Calgary-Northern Hills (ND)  
Littlewood, Jessica, Fort Saskatchewan-Vegreville (ND)  
Pitt, Angela D., Airdrie (W)\*  
van Dijken, Glenn, Barrhead-Morinville-Westlock (W)  
Woollard, Denise, Edmonton-Mill Creek (ND)

\* substitution for Glenn van Dijken

**Public Service Commission Participants**

Dot Ellerby	Consultant, Executive Search
Trish Mills	Director, Executive Search

**Support Staff**

Robert H. Reynolds, QC	Clerk
Shannon Dean	Law Clerk and Director of House Services
Trafton Koenig	Parliamentary Counsel
Stephanie LeBlanc	Parliamentary Counsel
Philip Massolin	Manager of Research and Committee Services
Sarah Amato	Research Officer
Nancy Robert	Research Officer
Corinne Dacyshyn	Committee Clerk
Jody Rempel	Committee Clerk
Aaron Roth	Committee Clerk
Karen Sawchuk	Committee Clerk
Rhonda Sorensen	Manager of Corporate Communications
Jeanette Dotimas	Communications Consultant
Tracey Sales	Communications Consultant
Cheryl Scarlett	Director of Human Resources, Information Technology and Broadcast Services
Janet Schwegel	Managing Editor of <i>Alberta Hansard</i>

9:30 a.m.

Tuesday, July 18, 2017

[Mr. Shepherd in the chair]

**The Chair:** Excellent. I'd like to welcome members, staff, and guests to this meeting of the Select Special Auditor General Search Committee. This is the first meeting of this committee.

My name is David Shepherd, MLA for Edmonton-Centre, chair of the committee. I'd like to ask that members and those joining the committee at the table introduce themselves for the record, and then we'll hear from those on the phone.

**Mr. Malkinson:** Hello. Good morning. My name is Brian Malkinson, MLA for Calgary-Currie, deputy chair.

**Mr. Kleinsteuber:** Good morning, folks. Jamie Kleinsteuber, MLA, Calgary-Northern Hills.

**Mr. Horne:** Good morning. Trevor Horne, MLA for Spruce Grove-St. Albert.

**Ms Scarlett:** Cheryl Scarlett. I'm the director of human resources, information technology, and broadcast services with the Legislative Assembly.

**Ms Mills:** Trish Mills, the director of executive search in the Public Service Commission.

**Ms Ellerby:** Dot Ellerby, executive search office.

**Mr. Cyr:** Scott Cyr, the MLA for Bonnyville-Cold Lake.

**Ms Sorensen:** Rhonda Sorensen, manager of corporate communications for the Legislative Assembly Office. Good morning.

**Dr. Massolin:** Good morning. Philip Massolin, manager of research and committee services.

**Ms Rempel:** Good morning. Jody Rempel, committee clerk.

**The Chair:** Thank you.  
On the phones?

**Mr. Gill:** Good morning. Prab Gill, MLA, Calgary-Greenway.

**Mrs. Littlewood:** Jessica Littlewood, MLA for Fort Saskatchewan-Vegreville. Thank you.

**Mrs. Pitt:** Angela Pitt, MLA, Airdrie.

**Ms Woollard:** Denise Woollard, MLA, Edmonton-Mill Creek.

**The Chair:** Thanks very much.

Just to confirm for the record, Mrs. Pitt is an official substitute for Mr. van Dijken.

Once again, before we turn to the business at hand, a few quick operational items. The microphone consoles are operated by the *Hansard* staff. Please ensure all cellphones are in silent mode. Audio of the committee proceedings is streamed live online and recorded by *Alberta Hansard*. Audio access and meeting transcripts can be obtained through the Legislative Assembly website.

Our first order of business before we proceed any further: I'd like to remind everyone that this is the first meeting of the search committee, and because we have members that are joining us by phone, we do need to address the issue of teleconferencing before we proceed further. As all committee members are aware, section 6 of the Legislative Assembly Act does permit participation in a committee meeting "by means of telephone or other communication

facilities that permit all Members participating in the meeting to hear each other if all the members of the committee consent." We have the option of passing a motion now to permit teleconferencing when available for the duration of our mandate, or we can deal with this on a meeting-by-meeting basis. A motion to permit teleconferencing for the duration of our mandate would not preclude the committee from determining that in-person attendance at a specific meeting is required, and either motion would need to pass unanimously. Do we have any discussion on the question of teleconferencing? Mr. Malkinson.

**Mr. Malkinson:** Thank you very much, Mr. Chair. I think that as per past practice this would be a good thing to do, so I would recommend that we pass that. I note that as we go along with these meetings, especially when we have in-person interviews, which are often off-site, teleconferencing is not possible or practical. For all other meetings, I mean, I think we want to really encourage everyone to be in the room once we start reviewing the candidates, but until then I think we'd like to have the option open for teleconferencing. I would recommend that all members vote unanimously for this.

**The Chair:** Okay. Are you making the motion, then, Mr. Malkinson, in that regard?

**Mr. Malkinson:** Yes.

**The Chair:** Okay. Thank you.  
Clerk, do we have a motion, then?

**Ms Rempel:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. I believe that Mr. Malkinson would like to move that

for the duration of its mandate the Select Special Auditor General Search Committee permit committee members to participate via teleconference subject to the proviso that the committee may require members' attendance at a particular meeting upon passage of a motion to that effect at a previous meeting.

**The Chair:** Thank you.

Any discussion, questions regarding the motion on the floor?

Hearing none, I'll call the question. All those in favour of the motion as read by the clerk? On the phones? I apologize. Those on the phones are unable to vote because we have not yet authorized teleconferencing. Any opposed? That motion is carried. Henceforth we will take votes from those on the phone.

We have, then, our agenda that was set out for today and that I believe was distributed and posted online. Do we have a member that would move a motion to adopt said agenda? Mr. Kleinsteuber. Thank you. All those in favour of adopting the agenda? Those on the phone? Thank you. Any opposed? That motion is carried.

We can begin, then, with our orientation for the search committee. Of course, the mandate for this committee is set out in detail by Government Motion 23, a copy of which has been provided to everyone for information purposes. Are there any questions regarding Government Motion 23?

Hearing none, we have the committee budget. There are funds in the committee budget to cover the work of this committee, including advertising costs, committee member travel, and so forth. Dr. Massolin can answer any questions anyone might have regarding the committee budget. Are there any?

Hearing none, we'll move on to the next item on the agenda, speaking of committee support. We've had the opportunity to go around the table and introduce ourselves, but I'd like to take a moment just to provide committee members with a little more information on the support available to us throughout the search

process. Of course, I believe everyone on this committee was involved in the previous search. Pardon me; Mr. Cyr was not involved in the previous search.

For Mr. Cyr: we have with us Trish Mills, director of executive search, who in addition to her professional expertise has also assisted a number of search committees in previous officer recruitment campaigns. I would also like to welcome Dot Ellerby, executive search consultant, who will be assisting us with all aspects of the recruitment process. Thank you for joining us. In addition to these two officials we'll have support from the Legislative Assembly Office, including human resources, communications, and the committees branch.

Quickly, a discussion, then, regarding substitutions and attendance. I would note that, as I just said, I guess most of us participated in the search committee process before, but this is a new committee, so we just want to ensure that we go through all the proper procedures that that entails. With that in mind, I would like to first raise the issue of substitutions.

As you're all aware, the standing orders allow for an official substitute to be designated to participate in a committee meeting on behalf of a committee member. However, although substitutes are permitted, the members of a previous search committee over several Legislatures have generally agreed amongst themselves not to appoint substitutes once the selection process begins in order to ensure consistency and fairness to candidates during all parts of the recruitment process. I believe that this has worked well in the past, but I'll leave it to the discretion of this committee as to whether or not we'll plan to take a similar approach.

We have an opportunity now for any questions or discussion regarding how we would like to approach the question of substitutions. Anyone have any thoughts or questions? Mr. Malkinson.

**Mr. Malkinson:** Thank you very much, Mr. Chair. Having done this previously, you know, I would think that on occasion there may be situations where stuff comes up and there may have to be a substitution. But I would agree with past practice that once we get into the meat of the selection process, if all members could commit to being there for the full process from that point onwards or to have the same substitute from that point onwards, that would be highly advantageous to smooth out the process. I wouldn't want to have it hard-and-fast, absolutely no substitutions because, you know, sometimes people get sick. I wouldn't want to completely get rid of the possibility, but I think I would encourage all members to very much be a part of that and not substitute if they can at all avoid it.

**The Chair:** Thank you, Mr. Malkinson.

**Mr. Cyr:** Was this a motion that was passed in the past, that there were no substitutes? I'm just curious. It just seems to be odd that we're bringing this up if we're planning on allowing substitutes.

**Ms Rempel:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. You know, as the chair mentioned, this is a common practice that has occurred not just for this Legislature but for many Legislatures with search committees. However, the standing orders themselves do allow for substitutions, so the committee cannot say that they cannot happen, but committee members can agree amongst themselves that they will endeavour not to make use of the substitution provisions. The committee does not have the authority to actually prevent them because they are permitted by the standing orders.

**Mr. Cyr:** Thank you. That was very informative. Thank you very much.

**The Chair:** Excellent. Also, as part of this it should be mentioned that as we get further in the process, we also have the question, then, of interview attendance and participation in selecting the final candidate of choice to be recommended by the committee. Again, this is something that's been addressed by previous search committees, and indeed with our committee for the Ombudsman we did discuss this as well. Generally there has been agreement among committee members that only members who have been present for all of the candidate interviews in their entirety should participate in the final candidate selection.

**9:40**

Again, to my understanding, this would be something that we would not pass a motion on, that would not be something that we can enforce in terms of standing orders, but it would be sort of a collegial agreement amongst members that it would be a fair practice.

Do you have any thoughts, comments, questions on that? So are we generally in agreement, then, as members that we will endeavour not to have substitutions once we begin the process and that we will only participate in the final selection of candidates if we have been able to be in attendance for all of the in-person interviews with candidates?

**Mrs. Littlewood:** Chair, could I be added to the speakers list?

**The Chair:** Yes; go ahead, Mrs. Littlewood.

**Mrs. Littlewood:** Thank you. I just want to speak in favour of not having substitutions for the interview process. After going through it in this last process with the Ombudsman and PIC recommendations, I just found that it was very useful and productive to have the same people around the table, that were part of the same conversations, that had access to the exact same material and discussions with each other during the entire process, so I am in favour of going forward in the same manner.

Thank you.

**The Chair:** Thank you, Mrs. Littlewood.

Does anyone else have any comments or questions? Hearing none, it seems we have general agreement amongst members on those two principles. I do commit as chair to working with the clerk to accommodate everyone's schedules as best as possible, to ensure a minimum of conflict so that we're all able to participate to the best of our abilities.

One last point regarding meeting attendance that's related to teleconferencing. We've made the decision to permit teleconference participation. I'll just remind committee members to please advise the committees branch through the clerk in advance if you wish to make use of that option, both so that we can be prepared and, secondly, to confirm that for that particular meeting teleconferencing will be available. As members who participated previously are aware, the interview process and some other portions may take place off-site, where teleconferencing services may not be available.

Finally, I'll just remind everyone quite briefly of the importance of respecting the confidentiality of all applicants throughout the search process. Out of regard for the privacy of potential candidates most briefing materials will be provided to committee members for their use only and are not for further distribution. The materials will be arranged in binders, which can be left with the committee clerk following each meeting so that documents can be shredded, reorganized, et cetera, as appropriate, before the next meeting. To ensure consistency for committee members, the materials prepared by the committees branch are distributed in a personalized binder,

so you can feel free to make any notes, et cetera, on your materials, and those will be preserved.

Does anyone have any questions or concerns about the process or the handling of confidential documents? Excellent.

All right, then. We'll move on to a few decision items regarding the beginning of this search process. Members will have a number of documents under this agenda item that were provided on the website that give some information specific to the recommended recruitment strategy.

But before we begin to review those, I would call for a motion to move in camera for a short discussion in this respect, and then we'll return to the record after that to complete the item of business. Do we have a member that would move to go in camera? Mr. Kleinsteuber. Thank you. Mr. Kleinsteuber has moved that the committee move in camera. All those in favour? On the phones? Any opposed? The committee will move in camera. Thank you.

[The committee met in camera from 9:44 a.m. to 10:13 a.m.]

**The Chair:** Excellent. We are back on the record. We'll open our discussions with agenda item 4(a), the draft Auditor General position profile. Following consultations with the Auditor General, as discussed, additional time is required to update and finalize a position profile document. The draft position profile document will be distributed at a later date via e-mail for committee members' review and comment. Any questions regarding this?

Do we have a member, then, that would like to make the motion on that?

**Mr. Kleinsteuber:** I move that

the Select Special Auditor General Search Committee authorize the chair and deputy chair to approve a position profile for the Auditor General following the distribution of a revised draft profile document to the committee members for review and comment.

**The Chair:** Okay. We have the motion. All those in favour? Any opposed? That motion is carried.

We have, then, the draft search timetable and process. The draft timeline for the recruitment process was included with the meeting materials. Ms Scarlett, do you have anything that you wish to identify from that document?

**Ms Scarlett:** Just to take in reference the document in terms of: you have a plan presented to you whereby we would initiate advertising early in September for the position. Based on our schedules for other search committees, we've laid out the primary activities and some proposed targets to allow us to work towards wrapping up this process in late December or early January, ideally.

**The Chair:** Excellent. Thank you, Ms Scarlett.

Do we have any questions, discussion on that draft timetable?

We'll move on, then, to the draft communications plan and the advertisement copy. A draft communications plan has been prepared for our consideration by the LAO communications branch. At this time I'd ask Ms Sorensen to address this document and give us a brief overview, and then we'll open the floor to discussion.

**Ms Sorensen:** Certainly. Thank you, Mr. Chair. First of all, what we did was that we took a look at the initiatives that we had used during the last AG search committee and combined those with, I guess, more recent initiatives that we undertook with the Ombudsman and PIC Search Committee.

What we're recommending is a combination of general advertising and more targeted advertising. The general advertising would go into the Alberta dailies as well as the two Canadian national

publications. With the *Globe and Mail* the one thing I wanted to point out because it is a rather large sum is that that is for three run cycles as well as a posting on eluta.ca. The more targeted approach goes into the professional associations related to accounting and chartered accountants. As well, we would be posting it on LinkedIn. Then we have a number of no-cost initiatives such as media relations and social media as well as the committee website that would supplement all the paid advertising.

Unless there are any questions, Mr. Chair, that's the plan.

**The Chair:** Thank you, Ms Sorensen.

Are there any questions or discussion regarding the draft communications plan? Mr. Malkinson.

**Mr. Malkinson:** Thank you very much, Mr. Chair. I note that there is a \$600 cost for advertising on LinkedIn. I would think that for a person of this calibre LinkedIn would be a good place to advertise. I'm just curious: how much advertising does one get for \$600 on LinkedIn?

**Ms Sorensen:** I'd have to look back at the last one that we did for the Ombudsman, but I believe that's a 30-day run that it stays on LinkedIn.

**Mr. Malkinson:** So it's a fairly significant amount of advertising?

**Ms Sorensen:** It is fairly significant. We would run that, of course, with the other ads and eluta so that it's all at the same time.

**Mr. Malkinson:** Okay. Awesome. Thank you.

**Ms Sorensen:** You're welcome.

**The Chair:** Mr. Kleinsteuber.

**Mr. Kleinsteuber:** Great. Yeah. I think the advertising plan here is very reasonable, and I think it's consistent with what we did before. But I also thought it was interesting, just anecdotally speaking, that it seemed that some of the talent was actually found through professional circles around some of the previous folks. A kind of comment I just wanted to raise, or maybe you might have a comment on that.

**Ms Sorensen:** Certainly, Mr. Chair, if I may.

**The Chair:** Certainly.

**Ms Sorensen:** I'm certain my colleagues at the end of the table would also be able to add to this, but for positions of this calibre where you're looking for a very specific set of skills, often the targeted advertising is really where you're going to get the candidates that you're looking for because they are invested in this profession already.

**Mr. Kleinsteuber:** I see.

**The Chair:** Excellent. Thank you.

Any other thoughts, questions? Anyone on the phones?

If not, do we have a member that would like to move a motion in regard to accepting this draft communications plan? Mr. Horne, thank you.

Clerk, do we have a motion?

**Ms Rempel:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. Moved by Mr. Horne that the Select Special Auditor General Search Committee adopt the communications plan as distributed.

**The Chair:** Excellent. Thank you.

All right. If there's no further discussion, then, I'll call the question. All those in favour? On the phones? Any opposed? That motion is carried.

That covers all the business we had on our agenda. Do members have anything for discussion under other business?

**Mr. Cyr:** Mr. Chair.

**The Chair:** Yes. Go ahead, Mr. Cyr.

**Mr. Cyr:** Is there any way that research can put together something that kind of shows the process of how we're moving forward with the selection, like, how the ratings are done, that kind of thing, just generally how this works its way through the system?

**10:20**

**The Chair:** Ms Mills, Ms Ellerby, would you be able to comment on that?

**Ms Mills:** We could provide an overview if you'd like, or I can try to speak to it somewhat at this point right now if you'd like. What would you like, Mr. Chair?

**The Chair:** Mr. Cyr, would you like an explanation now, or would you prefer a written overview?

**Mr. Cyr:** I would prefer a written one. That way I can look at it and see the whole picture. I don't need to know specifically about this one but kind of how it works for all of it. I know that, for myself, I've got confusion on how the rating system works in particular.

**Ms Mills:** Okay. We can do that.

**The Chair:** Thank you, Ms Mills. That would be appreciated. We'll work with Ms Mills, then, to get that put together and e-mailed out to all members.

Does anyone else have anything that we should raise under other business?

If not, we'll move on to our discussion, then, of the next meeting. As set out in the timeline, the recruitment campaign for the Auditor General position will occur in early September, and our next meeting will then be scheduled for the latter part of October to ensure that applicants have a reasonable time period to respond to our advertisements and to allow for the processing and organization of the initial applications by our support team prior to our review. We'll follow up with members as we get closer to that time.

With that, then, do we have a member that would like to make a motion to adjourn? Mr. Horne motions that we adjourn the meeting. All those in favour? On the phones? Any opposed? That motion is carried. The committee stands adjourned.

Thank you, everyone, for your time.

[The committee adjourned at 10:22 a.m.]



